

Big-step

$$1. \text{ NEG } \frac{\langle e, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow_b V}{\langle !e, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow_b !V} \quad \text{where } V \in \{\text{true}, \text{false}\}$$

2. For - F

$$\frac{\langle V := a_0, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma' \quad \langle V \leq a_1, \sigma' \rangle \Downarrow \text{false}}{\langle \text{for } V \text{ in } a_0 \text{ to } a_1 \text{ do } S, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma'}$$

$$\langle \text{for } V \text{ in } a_0 \text{ to } a_1 \text{ do } S, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma'$$

For - T

$$\langle \text{for } V \text{ in } V+1 \text{ to } a_1 \text{ do } S, \sigma' \rangle \Downarrow \sigma''$$

$$\frac{\langle V := a_0, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma' \quad \langle V \leq a_1, \sigma' \rangle \Downarrow \text{true} \quad \langle S, \sigma' \rangle \Downarrow \sigma''}{\langle \text{for } V \text{ in } a_0 \text{ to } a_1 \text{ do } S, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma'''}$$

$$\langle \text{for } V \text{ in } a_0 \text{ to } a_1 \text{ do } S, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma'''$$

3.

$$\text{Arith } \frac{\text{VAR } \frac{\langle a, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow 5}{\text{Assign } \langle t := a + b, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow 15} \quad \text{VAR } \frac{\langle b, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow 10}{\text{Assign } \langle a := b, \sigma' \rangle \Downarrow \sigma''}}{\text{Seq } \langle a := b; b := t, \sigma' \rangle \Downarrow \sigma'''}$$

$$\text{Assign } \frac{\text{VAR } \frac{\langle b, \sigma' \rangle \Downarrow 10}{\text{Assign } \langle a := b, \sigma' \rangle \Downarrow \sigma''} \quad \text{VAR } \frac{\langle t, \sigma'' \rangle \Downarrow 15}{\text{Assign } \langle b := t, \sigma'' \rangle \Downarrow \sigma'''}}{\text{Seq } \langle a := b; b := t, \sigma' \rangle \Downarrow \sigma'''}$$

$$\text{Assign } \frac{\text{Arith } \langle t := a + b, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow 15}{\text{Assign } \langle t := a + b, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma'}$$

$$\text{Seq } \frac{\text{Assign } \langle t := a + b, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma' \quad \text{Assign } \langle a := b; b := t, \sigma' \rangle \Downarrow \sigma'''}{\text{Seq } \langle t := a + b; a := b; b := t, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma'''}$$

where

$$\sigma = \{a := 5, b := 10\}$$

$$\sigma' = \{a := 5, b := 10, t := 15\}$$

$$\sigma'' = \{a := 10, b := 10, t := 15\}$$

$$\sigma''' = \{a := 10, b := 15, t := 15\}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 4. \text{ VAR } \frac{}{\langle x, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow 10} \quad \text{VAR } \frac{}{\langle y, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow 20} \\
 \text{REL} \frac{}{\langle x > y, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \text{false}} \\
 \text{IF-F} \frac{}{\langle \text{if } x > y \text{ then } m := x * 10 \text{ else } m := y * 10, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma'}
 \end{array}
 \quad
 \begin{array}{c}
 \text{VAR } \frac{}{\langle y, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow 20} \quad \text{literal } \frac{}{\langle 10, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow 10} \\
 \text{Arith} \frac{}{\langle y * 10, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow 200} \\
 \text{Assign} \frac{}{\langle m := y * 10, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma'}
 \end{array}$$

where $\sigma = \{x := 10, y := 20\}$

$\sigma' = \{x := 10, y := 20, m := 200\}$

5a. $\sigma' = \{x := n+1, \text{sum} := \sum_{x=m}^n x\}$ // skipped false case.

5b. $Q = "x := m; \text{while } x \leq n \text{ do } \text{sum} := \text{sum} + x; x := x + 1 \text{ od};"$

5c. We need to proof P and Q generate the same environment after execution, we use ~~true~~ true and false cases to proof them identical.

(1) False case: $\sigma = \{x := 0, \text{sum} := 0\}$ $\sigma' = \{x := m, \text{sum} := 0\}$.

P of For-F's proof tree:

$$\frac{\langle x := m, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma' \quad \langle x \leq n, \sigma' \rangle \Downarrow \text{false}}{\langle \text{for } x \text{ in } m \text{ to } n \text{ do } \text{sum} := \text{sum} + x, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma'}$$

Q of while-F's proof tree.

$$\text{seg} \frac{\text{Assign } \frac{}{\langle x := m, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma'} \quad \text{while-F } \frac{\langle x \leq n, \sigma' \rangle \Downarrow \text{false}}{\langle \text{while } x \leq n \text{ do } \text{sum} := \text{sum} + x; x := x + 1 \text{ od}; \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma'}}{\langle x := m; \text{while } x \leq n \text{ do } \text{sum} := \text{sum} + x; x := x + 1 \text{ od}; \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma'}$$

We note P and Q have same rules and generate the same σ' after execution, which means P and Q are equivalent in false case

(2) True case:

$$\begin{aligned}\sigma &= \{x := 0, \text{sum} := 0\} \\ \sigma' &= \{x := m, \text{sum} := 0\} \\ \sigma'' &= \{x := m, \text{sum} := m\} \\ \sigma''' &= \{x := m+1, \text{sum} := m\} \\ \sigma^{(n)} &= \{x := n+1, \text{sum} := \sum_{x=m}^n x\}.\end{aligned}$$

P of For-T's proof tree.

$$\langle x := m, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma' \quad \langle x \leq n, \sigma' \rangle \Downarrow \text{true} \quad \langle \text{sum} := \text{sum} + x, \sigma' \rangle \Downarrow \sigma'' \quad \langle \text{for } x \text{ in } x+1 \text{ to } n \text{ do } \text{sum} := \text{sum} + x, \sigma'' \rangle \Downarrow \sigma^{(n)}$$

$$\langle \text{for } x \text{ in } m \text{ to } n \text{ do } \text{sum} := \text{sum} + x, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma^{(n)}$$

Q of while-T's proof tree

$$\begin{aligned}\text{Assign } \langle x := m, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma' & \quad \text{while } \langle x \leq n, \sigma' \rangle \Downarrow \text{true} \quad \text{Seq } \langle \text{sum} := \text{sum} + x, \sigma' \rangle \Downarrow \sigma'' \quad \langle x := x+1, \sigma'' \rangle \Downarrow \sigma''' \\ \langle \text{while } x \leq n \text{ do } \text{sum} := \text{sum} + x; x := x+1, \sigma' \rangle \Downarrow \sigma^{(n)} & \quad \text{while iteration} \\ \text{Seq } \langle x := m; \text{while } x \leq n \text{ do } \text{sum} := \text{sum} + x; x := x+1 \text{ od}, \sigma \rangle \Downarrow \sigma^{(n)} & \quad \text{combine}\end{aligned}$$

In the P's proof tree, the For-iteration has the same rules as Q's precondition ^{combine} while iteration, which generates the same environment $\sigma^{(n)} = \{x := n+1, \text{sum} := \sum_{x=m}^n x\}$.

Therefore, P and Q are equivalent.